

# Detailed Table of Contents

Foreword	v
What Your Library Should Contain	vi
Preface	vii
Note on the Form of Citations	xiii
Acknowledgments	xiv
Board of Reviewers	xv
Summary Table of Contents	xvii
<b>Part I.</b>	<b>The Scope of Civil Rights Protections: Coverage, Construction, and Remedies</b> . . . . . 1
<b>Chapter 1.</b>	<b>The Constitution, and Reconstruction-Era Civil Rights Statutes</b> . . . . . 1-1
A.	Background . . . . . 1-1
B.	The First Amendment . . . . . 1-1
	1. Freedom of Speech . . . . . 1-2
	2. Freedom of Religion . . . . . 1-2
C.	The Second Amendment . . . . . 1-2
D.	The Fourth Amendment . . . . . 1-2
E.	The Fifth Amendment . . . . . 1-3
	1. The Due Process Clause . . . . . 1-3
	2. The Self-Incrimination Clause . . . . . 1-4
F.	The Tenth Amendment . . . . . 1-4
G.	The Thirteenth Amendment . . . . . 1-4
H.	The Fourteenth Amendment . . . . . 1-4
I.	Other Constitutional Provisions . . . . . 1-5
J.	Reconstruction-Era Civil Rights Acts . . . . . 1-5
	1. 42 U.S.C. § 1981 . . . . . 1-5
	(a) General Construction of the Statute . . . . . 1-5
	(b) Questions of Construction Governed by the 1991 Amendment . . . . . 1-9
	(c) Questions of Construction Governed by <i>Patterson</i> . . . . . 1-10
	2. 42 U.S.C. § 1983 . . . . . 1-11
	3. 42 U.S.C. § 1985 Civil Rights Conspiracy Claims . . . . . 1-14
	4. 42 U.S.C. § 1986 Claims of Failure to Prevent a § 1985 Violation . . . . . 1-18
<b>Chapter 2.</b>	<b>Unions' Duty of Fair Representation With Respect to Equal Employment Opportunity</b> . . . . . 2-19
A.	Background . . . . . 2-19
B.	Procedural Questions . . . . . 2-20
C.	Substantive Questions . . . . . 2-21
D.	Remedial Questions . . . . . 2-24
<b>Chapter 3.</b>	<b>Equal Pay Act</b> . . . . . 3-25
A.	Background . . . . . 3-25
B.	Eleventh Amendment . . . . . 3-25

C.	Elements of a <i>Prima Facie</i> Case . . . . .	3–26
1.	Equal Work . . . . .	3–26
2.	Unequal Pay . . . . .	3–29
D.	Affirmative Defenses . . . . .	3–29
E.	Statute of Limitations . . . . .	3–30
F.	Jurisdiction . . . . .	3–30
G.	Damages . . . . .	3–30
1.	Common-Law Damages for Retaliation Claims . . . . .	3–30
2.	After-Acquired Evidence . . . . .	3–31
3.	Method of Calculation . . . . .	3–31
<b>Chapter 4.</b>	<b>Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 . . . . .</b>	<b>4–32</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	4–32
B.	Coverage . . . . .	4–32
C.	Construction . . . . .	4–32
<b>Chapter 5.</b>	<b>Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 . . . . .</b>	<b>5–35</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	5–36
B.	Applicability of Amendments Made by the Civil Rights Act of 1991 to Events That Occurred Before November 21, 1991 . . . . .	5–36
1.	The <i>Landgraf</i> Decision . . . . .	5–36
2.	The Application of <i>Landgraf</i> to Title VII Claims . . . . .	5–37
(a)	Compensatory and Punitive Damages, and Jury Trial, Under § 102 . . . . .	5–37
(b)	Justification for Practices With Disparate Impact Under §§ 104 and 105 . . . . .	5–37
(c)	Challenges to Court Orders Under § 108 . . . . .	5–37
(d)	Expert Fees Under § 113 . . . . .	5–37
(e)	Interest Awards Under § 114 . . . . .	5–38
(f)	Federal-Sector Suit-Filing Period Under § 114 . . . . .	5–38
C.	Coverage . . . . .	5–38
D.	Construction . . . . .	5–40
1.	Administrative Processing . . . . .	5–40
2.	Adverse Employment Actions . . . . .	5–40
3.	Associational Discrimination . . . . .	5–41
4.	Causation and Intent . . . . .	5–42
5.	Citizenship . . . . .	5–42
6.	Claims by In-House Counsel . . . . .	5–42
7.	Color Discrimination . . . . .	5–42
8.	Corroboration . . . . .	5–42
9.	Deferral Agencies . . . . .	5–43
10.	Enforcement of Conciliation Agreements and Pre-Determination Settlement Agreements . . . . .	5–43
11.	Exhaustion of the Employer’s Internal Procedures . . . . .	5–43
12.	Existence of an Employment Relationship . . . . .	5–43
13.	Extraterritoriality . . . . .	5–49
14.	Failure to Train . . . . .	5–49
15.	Favoritism to Others Because of Nepotism, Cronyism, or Sexual Favors . . . . .	5–49
16.	Gender and “Gender-Plus” Discrimination . . . . .	5–49
17.	Grooming Policies . . . . .	5–49
18.	Indemnification . . . . .	5–49

19. Indian Preference Exemption . . . . .	5-49
20. Indian Tribe Exemption . . . . .	5-50
21. Individual Liability . . . . .	5-50
22. Ministerial Exemption . . . . .	5-50
23. Mixed Motives . . . . .	5-51
24. Multiple Employers . . . . .	5-51
25. National Origin . . . . .	5-53
26. Number of Employees . . . . .	5-53
27. Pay Discrimination . . . . .	5-54
28. Personal-Staff Exclusion . . . . .	5-55
29. Pregnancy Discrimination . . . . .	5-55
30. Private Club Exclusion . . . . .	5-56
31. Prohibited Discrimination . . . . .	5-56
(a) Combined Bases of Discrimination . . . . .	5-56
(b) Other Questions . . . . .	5-56
32. Racial Status . . . . .	5-57
33. Religious Discrimination and Reasonable Accommodation . . . . .	5-57
34. Retaliation . . . . .	5-61
35. Same-Sex Sexual Harassment . . . . .	5-63
36. Persons Accused of Racial or Sexual Harassment . . . . .	5-65
37. Self-Defense by Victims . . . . .	5-65
38. Seniority . . . . .	5-66
39. Sex Discrimination . . . . .	5-66
40. Standing . . . . .	5-67
41. Stereotyping . . . . .	5-67
42. Successor Liability . . . . .	5-68
43. Union: Definition . . . . .	5-68
44. Union Liability for Acts of Employers . . . . .	5-68
45. Workload . . . . .	5-69
46. Venue . . . . .	5-69
E. Regulations . . . . .	5-70
F. Early Issuance of Notices of Right to Sue . . . . .	5-70
G. First Amendment Considerations . . . . .	5-70
1. Freedom of Expression . . . . .	5-70
2. Freedom of Religion . . . . .	5-70
H. Making a Title VII Claim Unintentionally Under the “Artful Pleading” Rule . . . . .	5-71
I. Pattern-and-Practice Claims . . . . .	5-71
J. Relationship Between Title VII and Other Statutes . . . . .	5-71
K. Treaty Rights . . . . .	5-71
L. Tribal Sovereign Immunity . . . . .	5-71
M. Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act . . . . .	5-72
N. Security Clearance Exception . . . . .	5-72
O. Claims Against an Agency for Failure to Perform Proper Investigations . . . . .	5-72
<b>Chapter 6. Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 . . . . .</b>	<b>6-74</b>
A. Background . . . . .	6-74
B. Jurisdiction Over Employment Discrimination . . . . .	6-76
C. Eleventh Amendment Issues . . . . .	6-76
D. Standing, Mootness, and Justiciability . . . . .	6-76

E.	Statute of Limitations .....	6-76
F.	Substantive Decisions .....	6-76
<b>Chapter 7.</b>	<b>Age Discrimination, and the Older Workers Benefit Protection Act.</b> .....	<b>7-78</b>
A.	Materially Adverse Employment Action .....	7-79
B.	Disparate Treatment .....	7-80
1.	Replacement by Someone Over Forty Years Old .....	7-81
2.	Reverse Age Discrimination .....	7-83
3.	The Same Actor “Defense” .....	7-83
4.	Overqualification .....	7-84
5.	Statistics .....	7-84
6.	Employer’s Nondiscriminatory Reasons .....	7-84
7.	Cases Surviving Summary Judgment or Affirming Jury Verdicts for the Plaintiff .....	7-96
8.	Mandatory Retirement .....	7-100
9.	Reductions in Force .....	7-101
10.	Hostile Environment Claims .....	7-104
11.	Innocent Decisions Influenced by Discriminatory Input .....	7-104
C.	Disparate Impact Analysis .....	7-105
D.	Constructive Discharge .....	7-107
E.	“Employer” and “Employee” Defined .....	7-108
1.	Individual Liability .....	7-108
2.	Statutory Definitions .....	7-108
F.	Statutory Defenses .....	7-110
1.	The Foreign Law Defense .....	7-110
2.	The Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense .....	7-110
3.	Differentiation in Benefit Plans .....	7-110
G.	Open Window Plans .....	7-111
H.	Validity of Releases .....	7-111
1.	General Principles .....	7-111
2.	The Older Workers Benefit Protection Act. ....	7-111
(a)	A Tender-Back Requirement .....	7-112
(b)	No Waiver of Future Claims .....	7-112
(c)	Requirements for a “Program” .....	7-112
(1)	Definition of a Program .....	7-112
(2)	The Statistical Requirements .....	7-112
(d)	Waiver When a Charge or Suit Has Been Filed .....	7-112
I.	The Safe Harbor of OWBPA .....	7-113
J.	Eleventh Amendment .....	7-113
K.	Procedural Requirements and Class Actions .....	7-114
L.	Damages .....	7-116
M.	Common-Law Damages for Retaliation Claims .....	7-119
N.	Preemption of Common-Law Claims .....	7-119
O.	Jurisdictional Reach of the ADEA .....	7-119
<b>Chapter 8.</b>	<b>Benefit Plans and EEO.</b> .....	<b>8-120</b>
A.	Background .....	8-120
B.	Sex Discrimination in Employee Benefits .....	8-121

	1. The Pregnancy Discrimination Act	8-121
	2. Terms of the Plan	8-121
C.	Americans with Disabilities Act	8-122
	1. ADA Claims by Recipients of Long-Term Disability Benefits	8-122
	2. Reasonable Accommodation	8-122
	3. Disability-Based Distinctions in ERISA Covered Plans	8-123
	4. ADA Claims by Retirees	8-123
D.	Age Discrimination in Employment Act	8-124
	1. Exceptions to ADEA's Prohibitions Related to Retirement Plans	8-124
	2. Exceptions to ADEA's Prohibitions Related to Welfare Plans	8-124
	3. Disparate Eligibility for Benefits	8-124
	4. Disparate Benefits Impact	8-125
	5. The Effective Date of the Ban on Age-Based Discrimination in Participation in Employee Benefit Plans	8-125
E.	Prohibition of Discrimination Under ERISA	8-126
	1. ERISA Section 510 and Layoffs	8-126
	2. ERISA Section 510 Claims and Plan Amendments and Terminations	8-126
	3. Disability-Based Discrimination and ERISA Section 510 Claims	8-126
	4. ERISA Section 510 and the ADEA	8-127
	5. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Litigation	8-127
F.	Benefits Under the FMLA	8-127
G.	Employee Classification	8-128
H.	Race/National Origin Discrimination	8-128
<b>Chapter 9.</b>	<b>Disability Discrimination</b>	<b>9-129</b>
A.	Background	9-130
B.	Definitions	9-130
	1. Disability	9-130
	2. Regarded as Disabled	9-143
	3. Qualified Individual With a Disability	9-149
	(a) General	9-149
	(b) Direct Threat	9-152
	(c) Effect of Application for or Determination of Disability	9-153
	4. Employee	9-154
	5. Employer	9-155
	(a) Individual Liability	9-157
	(b) Agents of the Employer	9-157
	(c) Recipients of Federal Financial Assistance	9-158
C.	Medical Inquiries	9-158
D.	Disparate Treatment	9-159
	1. Discrimination Based on a Known Disability	9-159
	2. The <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	9-161
	3. Proof of Disparate Treatment	9-162
	(a) Stray Comments and Direct Evidence	9-162
	(b) Comparative and Other Circumstantial Evidence	9-163
	(c) Pretext	9-163
	4. Mixed Motives	9-164
	5. Harassment	9-165
E.	Reasonable Accommodation	9-165

1.	General Theory and Elements of Proof	9-165
(a)	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case	9-166
2.	Particular Forms of Accommodation	9-166
(a)	Leave and Absences	9-166
(b)	Transfer	9-167
(c)	Work at Home	9-168
(d)	Parking Spaces	9-168
(e)	Extra Chances	9-168
(f)	Collective Bargaining Agreements	9-169
(g)	Other	9-169
(h)	Interactive Process	9-171
3.	Reasonable Accommodation for Applicants	9-172
4.	Public Accommodations	9-172
F.	Disparate Impact	9-173
G.	Fringe Benefits	9-173
H.	Privacy	9-174
I.	Timeliness	9-174
J.	Remedies	9-177
K.	Preemption	9-178
L.	Class Actions	9-179
M.	Sovereign Immunity	9-179
N.	Retaliation	9-183
O.	Miscellaneous	9-187
<b>Chapter 10.</b>	<b>Immigration Reform and Control Act</b>	10-190
A.	Background	10-190
B.	Court Decisions	10-191
<b>Chapter 11.</b>	<b>The Federal Family and Medical Leave Act</b>	11-193
A.	Background	11-193
B.	Employers Covered by the Act	11-194
C.	Employees Entitled to Family and Medical Leave: Eligibility Requirements	11-194
1.	Length of Service and Hours Requirement	11-195
2.	Worksite	11-195
D.	Qualifying Circumstances	11-197
1.	Birth or Placement of New Children	11-197
2.	Employee's Own Serious Health Condition	11-198
(a)	"Serious Health Condition" Defined	11-198
(b)	Employer's Right to Obtain Certification	11-199
(c)	Notice Requirement	11-199
3.	Care for Employee's Spouse, Child or Parent With Serious Health Condition	11-200
E.	Terms of FMLA Leave	11-201
1.	Amount of Leave	11-201
(a)	Intermittent Leave	11-201
(b)	Employer's Right to Transfer	11-202
(c)	Spouses Who Work for the Same Employer	11-202
2.	Compensation and Benefits During FMLA Leave	11-202
F.	Rights Upon Return From FMLA Leave	11-202
1.	Reinstatement	11-202

	2. Failure to Return . . . . .	11-204
G.	Employer’s Obligation to Provide Information to Employees Concerning Their Rights Under the Act. . . . .	11-205
	1. Posted Notice . . . . .	11-205
	2. Update Policies . . . . .	11-205
	3. Specific Notice . . . . .	11-205
H.	Discrimination and Retaliation Claims . . . . .	11-206
I.	Government Employees . . . . .	11-209
J.	Compulsory Arbitration . . . . .	11-209
K.	Attorneys’ Fees . . . . .	11-209
L.	Right to Jury Trial . . . . .	11-209
M.	Relationship to Other Laws . . . . .	11-209
N.	Claim Preclusion . . . . .	11-210
O.	State Immunity . . . . .	11-210
<b>Chapter 12.</b>	<b>The WARN Act . . . . .</b>	<b>12-212</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	12-212
B.	The Notice Requirement . . . . .	12-213
	1. Statutory Overview . . . . .	12-213
	2. The Meaning of “Employer” . . . . .	12-214
	3. The Meaning of “Employment Loss” . . . . .	12-215
	(a) Termination of Employment . . . . .	12-215
	(b) Layoffs for Less Than 6 Months . . . . .	12-215
	(c) Reduction in Hours . . . . .	12-215
	4. The Meaning of “Single Site of Employment” . . . . .	12-215
	5. Exceptions to the Notice Requirement . . . . .	12-216
	(a) The Unforeseeable Business Circumstances Exception . . . . .	12-216
	(b) The Sale of Business “Exception” . . . . .	12-217
	6. Defective WARN Act Notices . . . . .	12-217
C.	Enforcement . . . . .	12-217
	1. Union Standing . . . . .	12-217
	2. Statute of Limitations . . . . .	12-218
	3. Remedies . . . . .	12-218
	(a) Back Pay . . . . .	12-218
	(1) Cases Applying the “Calendar Days” Interpretation . . . . .	12-218
	(2) Cases Applying the “Work Days” Interpretation . . . . .	12-218
	(b) Attorney’s Fees and Prejudgment Interest . . . . .	12-218
	(c) Judicial Discretion to Reduce Damages . . . . .	12-219
	(d) Reduction of Damages Due to Other “Voluntary and Unconditional” Payments . . . . .	12-220
D.	Pay-in-Lieu-of-Notice . . . . .	12-220
E.	Waiver . . . . .	12-220
<b>Part II.</b>	<b>Theories and Proof . . . . .</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>Chapter 13.</b>	<b>Facial Discrimination: Bona Fide Occupational Qualifications . . . . .</b>	<b>13-221</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	13-221
B.	The Distinction Between a BFOQ Defense and Other Defenses . . . . .	13-223
C.	The Elements of the BFOQ Defense . . . . .	13-223
D.	Privacy Concerns . . . . .	13-224

<b>Chapter 14.</b>	<b>The <i>McDonnell Douglas / Burdine / Hicks</i> Model</b>	14-226
A.	Background	14-229
B.	Articulations of the Standards for <i>Prima Facie</i> Cases	14-236
	1. Hiring and Rehiring	14-236
	2. Promotion	14-237
	3. Pay	14-240
	4. Discharge	14-241
	5. Demotion	14-246
	6. Discipline	14-247
	7. Layoff or Reduction in Force (“RIF”)	14-248
	8. Pregnancy	14-250
	9. Retaliation	14-251
	(a) In Violation of the Fair Employment Laws	14-251
	(b) In Violation of the Fair Labor Standards Act	14-260
	(c) In Violation of the First Amendment	14-260
	(d) In Violation of Whistleblower Laws	14-264
	10. Tenure Decisions	14-264
	11. Terms and Conditions of Employment	14-264
	12. Training	14-266
	13. Disability Claims	14-266
	14. “Reverse Discrimination” Claims	14-267
	15. Religious Discrimination	14-268
	16. ERISA Claims	14-269
	17. Union Decisions Not to Prosecute Grievances	14-269
	18. Claims of Independent Contractors	14-269
	19. The Nature of the Presumption Created by the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	14-269
C.	Detailed Application of the Standards for the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	14-269
	1. Bypassing the Issue and Going Straight to Pretext	14-269
	2. Awareness of Membership in a Protected Group or of Protected Activity	14-271
	3. Qualifications (Hiring and Promotion Cases)	14-273
	4. Meeting the Employer’s Legitimate Expectations (Transfer, Discharge, Demotion, Layoff, and RIF Cases)	14-277
	5. Application	14-282
	6. Whether Positions Were Available	14-285
	7. Whether the Challenged Action Is an Adverse Employment Action	14-285
	8. Termination, Resignation, or Constructive Discharge	14-294
	9. Whether the Selection Process Continued, or the Position Remained Open (Hiring and Promotion Cases)	14-294
	10. Whether the Position Was Filled by a Person From a Different Group	14-294
	11. Whether the Position Was Filled by Someone Substantially Younger	14-296
	12. Whether the Case Is a “Replacement” Case or a Layoff Case	14-297
	13. Whether the Plaintiff Was Replaced, in Discharge Cases Not Involving Layoffs	14-298
	14. Whether the Former Position Remained Open in Layoff Cases	14-298
	15. Whether Younger Persons, or Persons Outside the Protected Class, Were Treated More Favorably	14-298
	16. The Similarity of the Replacement’s Qualifications	14-300
	17. Availability, in a RIF, of Other Positions the Plaintiff Is Qualified to Fill	14-300

18. Pay .....	14-300
19. Discipline .....	14-300
20. The “Protected Speech or Activity” Requirement in Retaliation Cases .....	14-300
21. The “Opposition to Unlawful Conduct” Requirement in Retaliation Cases .....	14-317
22. The Decisionmaker’s Knowledge of the Protected Activity .....	14-318
23. The “Adverse Action” Requirement in Retaliation Cases .....	14-320
24. Shunning as an Adverse Action .....	14-340
25. The “Causal Link” Requirement in Retaliation Cases .....	14-341
26. The “Causal Link” Requirement in ERISA § 510 Cases .....	14-355
27. Other Evidence of Discrimination in Establishing a <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	14-355
28. Strength of the Proof .....	14-355
D. The Legal Standards Governing the Asserted Nondiscriminatory Reason .....	14-356
1. The Degree of the Defendant’s Burden .....	14-356
2. The Timing and Manner of the Production .....	14-356
3. The Legal Sufficiency of the Articulated Reason .....	14-357
4. The Requirement That the Reason Be Supported by Evidence .....	14-362
5. Subjective Explanations .....	14-363
6. Special Situations of Deference to the Employer .....	14-364
(a) Upper-Level Managers .....	14-364
(b) Attorneys .....	14-365
(c) Physicians .....	14-365
(d) College and University Hiring and Tenure Decisions .....	14-365
E. “Same Actor / Short Time” Inferences .....	14-365
1. The Strength of the Inference .....	14-366
(a) “Strong Inference” Cases .....	14-366
(b) Cases Rejecting a “Strong Inference” Rule .....	14-366
(c) Cases Not Articulating a Clear Standard .....	14-366
2. How Short Must the Period of Time Be? .....	14-367
3. Is the Decisionmaker Really the Same? .....	14-367
4. Did the Circumstances Change? .....	14-367
5. Did the Employer’s Understanding Change? .....	14-368
6. Plaintiffs’ Offensive Use of the “Same Actor” Inference .....	14-368
F. Plaintiff’s Right to Discovery .....	14-368
G. The Legal Standards Governing Proof of Pretext .....	14-368
1. The Description and Required Strength of the Proof of Pretext .....	14-368
(a) D.C. Circuit .....	14-371
(b) First Circuit .....	14-371
(c) Second Circuit .....	14-372
(d) Third Circuit .....	14-372
(e) Fourth Circuit .....	14-372
(f) Fifth Circuit .....	14-374
(g) Sixth Circuit .....	14-375
(h) Seventh Circuit .....	14-377
(i) Eighth Circuit .....	14-378
(j) Ninth Circuit .....	14-379
(k) Tenth Circuit .....	14-381
(l) Eleventh Circuit .....	14-383
2. Subjective Beliefs of the Plaintiff and Witnesses .....	14-383
3. Conclusory Assertions .....	14-385

4.	Time-Barred Acts as Proof of Discriminatory Animus . . . . .	14-388
5.	Statistical Evidence . . . . .	14-388
6.	More Favorable Treatment of Comparable Employees . . . . .	14-388
7.	Comparative Qualifications of the Plaintiff . . . . .	14-388
8.	Improper Statements and Occurrences . . . . .	14-391
9.	Defendant's Inconsistent or Changing Explanations . . . . .	14-391
10.	Preposterous Explanations . . . . .	14-395
11.	Management Inconsistencies . . . . .	14-402
12.	Failure to Document the Plaintiff's Problems . . . . .	14-405
13.	Document Destruction, Creation, and Tampering . . . . .	14-406
14.	RIF Rules and Changes . . . . .	14-406
15.	Finding Alternative Positions for the Plaintiff in a RIF . . . . .	14-406
16.	The "Determinative Influence" Requirement . . . . .	14-407
17.	Lack of a "Sole Basis" Requirement . . . . .	14-408
18.	Mistakes vs. Insincerity . . . . .	14-409
19.	Blaming Others for the Plaintiff's Problems . . . . .	14-414
20.	The Effect of Prior Performance Appraisals . . . . .	14-414
	(a) Defendant's Reliance on Assertedly Poor Past Performance . . . . .	14-414
	(b) Plaintiff's Reliance on Good Past Performance . . . . .	14-415
	(c) Alleged Deterioration in Plaintiff's Performance . . . . .	14-418
	(d) Comparison of Performance of Different Employees . . . . .	14-419
	(e) Joinder of Disability and Other Claims: Plaintiff's Inconsistent Positions as to the Quality of His or Her Own Work Performance . . . . .	14-419
21.	Demands for Improved Performance . . . . .	14-419
22.	Complications of Ingratitude or Disloyalty . . . . .	14-419
23.	The Bona Fides of the RIF or of Financial Pressures . . . . .	14-419
24.	The Potential "Work Rule" Exception on Summary Judgment . . . . .	14-420
25.	Facts That Only Conditionally Show Pretext . . . . .	14-420
26.	Other Types of Evidence Held Inadequate to Show Pretext . . . . .	14-420
27.	Types of Evidence Held to Rebut a Claim of Pretext . . . . .	14-422
28.	The Aggregation of Evidence . . . . .	14-422
29.	Evidence of a Favorable or a Hostile Environment . . . . .	14-422
30.	Confession and Avoidance . . . . .	14-422
31.	Disqualifying the Plaintiff as a Witness . . . . .	14-423
H.	Rebutting Some But Not All of the Employer's Reasons . . . . .	14-423
I.	Waiver of the Right to Articulate Nondiscriminatory Reasons . . . . .	14-424
J.	Review of the Decision Whether to Draw the Inference of Discrimination . . . . .	14-424
K.	Other Procedural Questions . . . . .	14-424
L.	National Security as a Bar to Inquiring Into Pretext . . . . .	14-424
M.	Using a <i>Price Waterhouse</i> Defense Instead of a <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Defense . . . . .	14-425
<b>Chapter 15.</b>	<b>Comparators . . . . .</b>	<b>15-426</b>
A.	The Legal Standards Governing the Use of Comparative Evidence . . . . .	15-426
B.	The Failure to Provide Comparative Evidence . . . . .	15-430
C.	Plaintiff's Comparison Accepted . . . . .	15-436
D.	Plaintiff's Comparison Rejected . . . . .	15-447
E.	Defendant's Comparison Accepted . . . . .	15-461
F.	Defendant's Comparison Rejected . . . . .	15-464

<b>Chapter 16.</b>	<b>Statistics</b> .....	16-466
A.	Background .....	16-466
B.	Threshold Questions as to Probative Value .....	16-469
C.	Cases Involving the “Inexorable Zero” .....	16-470
D.	The Need for a Yardstick Against Which to Measure the Observed Statistics .....	16-472
E.	The Yardstick Against Which the Observed Outcome Is to Be Judged .....	16-473
	1. The Relevance of Qualifications .....	16-473
	2. Civilian Labor Force Data .....	16-473
	3. Applicant-Flow Data .....	16-474
	4. Internal Employment Data .....	16-474
F.	Reliably Measuring the Outcome .....	16-476
	1. Measuring Relevant Decisions .....	16-476
	2. “Snapshot” Statistics .....	16-476
	3. “Dynamic” Statistics .....	16-477
	4. Causation .....	16-477
	5. Claims of Missing Variables .....	16-477
	6. Outliers .....	16-480
G.	Determining Whether an Observed Disparity Between the Yardstick and the Outcome Is the Result of the Respondent’s Actions or the Result of Chance .....	16-480
	1. The “Inexorable Zero” .....	16-480
	2. Statistical Significance .....	16-480
	3. The Four-Fifths Rule .....	16-481
H.	Regression Analysis .....	16-481
I.	Limitations of Statistical Procedures Caused by Small Sample Sizes .....	16-482
J.	Class Actions and “Pattern and Practice” Cases .....	16-482
K.	Individual Cases .....	16-483
	1. Use of Statistics to Prove or Disprove Intent .....	16-483
	2. Use of Statistics to Help Establish or Rebut a <i>Prima Facie</i> Case Under the <i>McDonnell Douglas / Burdine / Hicks</i> Inferential Model .....	16-484
	3. Use of Statistics to Help Establish a Nondiscriminatory Explanation and to Help Refute Any Claim of Pretext .....	16-484
	4. Use of Statistics to Help Prove Pretext .....	16-485
<b>Chapter 17.</b>	<b>Direct Proof and Stray Remarks</b> .....	17-487
A.	Background: “Direct Proof” vs. “Stray Remarks” .....	17-487
B.	Standard Used to Decide if Evidence Is “Direct Proof” or a “Stray Remark” .....	17-489
	1. Definitions .....	17-489
	2. The Ambiguity or Clarity of Any Bias in the Statement or Occurrence .....	17-494
	3. The Intensity of Bias Reflected in the Statement or Occurrence .....	17-506
	4. The Proximity or Remoteness in Time of the Statement or Occurrence .....	17-508
	5. Proof of Causation .....	17-512
	6. The Position or Status of the Declarant .....	17-516
	7. The Fairness of Using the Statement or Occurrence to Show Motivation .....	17-526
C.	Other Examples of Evidence Held to Constitute “Direct Proof” or to Be Probative .....	17-532
D.	Other Evidence Held to Be “Stray Remarks” or “Isolated Events” .....	17-534
E.	The Use of Hostile Epithets .....	17-535
	1. Racially Hostile Epithets .....	17-535
	2. Sexual Epithets .....	17-535
	3. Age-Related Epithets .....	17-535

F.	Offers of Early Retirement .....	17-536
G.	Remarks Bearing on Punitive Damages and the Good-Faith Effort to Comply.....	17-536
<b>Chapter 18.</b>	<b>Mixed Motives .....</b>	<b>18-537</b>
A.	Background: The <i>Price Waterhouse</i> and <i>Desert Palace</i> Decisions .....	18-537
B.	The Applicability of Mixed-Motives Analysis to Non-Title VII Claims .....	18-539
C.	Applicability of § 107 of the Civil Rights Act of 1991 .....	18-540
D.	The Evidence Required to Trigger Mixed-Motives Analysis.....	18-541
	1. Mixed-Motives Analysis May Not Apply to Some Multiple-Motive Cases .....	18-541
	2. Both Sides Can Invoke the Theory.....	18-542
	3. Reliance on Circumstantial Evidence.....	18-542
	4. The Required Quantum of Evidence .....	18-542
	5. The Procedure Followed in Determining the Sufficiency of the Evidence .....	18-544
	6. Skipping Sufficiency and Proceeding Directly to the Defendant's Burden .....	18-544
E.	Use of the Mixed-Motives Approach in Cases Not Involving Mixed Motives .....	18-544
F.	Use of the Mixed-Motives Approach in Cases With Multiple Decisionmakers.....	18-544
G.	Defendant's Need to Prove Actual Motivation by the Asserted Reason .....	18-545
H.	Required Quantum of Evidence for the Defendant to Discharge Its Burden .....	18-545
I.	The Defendant's Burden of Proving the Plaintiff Was Not Injured .....	18-547
J.	Relief After the Defendant Discharges Its Burden .....	18-548
<b>Chapter 19.</b>	<b>Other Circumstantial Proof as to Intentional Discrimination .....</b>	<b>19-549</b>
A.	Types of Circumstantial Evidence Offered to Show Disparate Treatment.....	19-549
B.	Manipulation of, or Failure to Follow, Procedures.....	19-550
C.	"Doctoring" Personnel Records and Engaging in Cover-Ups .....	19-559
D.	Similar Conduct as to Others .....	19-563
E.	Subjective Decisionmaking .....	19-563
F.	Insulated Independent Decisionmakers .....	19-564
G.	Evidence of the Presence or Absence of an Atmosphere of Discrimination .....	19-566
H.	Evidence of Pressure to Hire Minorities or Women.....	19-570
I.	Economic Benefit to the Defendant From Discrimination.....	19-571
J.	Participation by a Member of the Protected Group in the Challenged Decision .....	19-571
K.	Other Evidence Offered to Prove or Disprove Discrimination.....	19-572
	1. Timing.....	19-572
	2. Passing Over a Person in a Protected Group in Favor of a Person From Outside .....	19-591
	3. Claims of Bizarre Management Conduct .....	19-591
	4. Failures to Act.....	19-592
	5. Proffering Pretextual Reasons for the Challenged Action .....	19-593
	6. Lying and Hiring Labor Lawyers .....	19-598
	7. Listing Race, Gender, Age, Birth Date, or Protected Activities on Documents. . .	19-601
	8. Requesting Waivers .....	19-602
	9. Personal Conflict With a Supervisor.....	19-602
	10. Other Types of Evidence Offered to Support Plaintiffs .....	19-602
L.	Other Evidence Offered to Rebut Claims of Discrimination .....	19-603
<b>Chapter 20.</b>	<b>Disparate Impact Against a Protected Group .....</b>	<b>20-604</b>
A.	Background.....	20-604
B.	Availability of Disparate Impact Analysis .....	20-607
	1. In General .....	20-607

2.	Under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act . . . . .	20-608
3.	Under the Rehabilitation Act . . . . .	20-609
C.	Proof of Disparate Impact . . . . .	20-609
D.	Job-Relatedness . . . . .	20-613
E.	Test Fairness . . . . .	20-615
F.	Less Discriminatory Alternatives . . . . .	20-615
G.	Norming Tests Under § 106 of the Civil Rights Act of 1991 . . . . .	20-617
H.	Constraints on the Remedy for an Unjustified Practice With Disparate Impact . . . . .	20-617
<b>Chapter 21.</b>	<b>Constructive Discharge . . . . .</b>	<b>21-618</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	21-618
1.	Elements of the Claim . . . . .	21-618
2.	Employer Actions That May or May Not Constitute Constructive Discharge . . . . .	21-621
B.	Constructive Discharge as a Result of Age Discrimination . . . . .	21-628
1.	Generally . . . . .	21-628
2.	Early Retirement Offers . . . . .	21-629
C.	Constructive Discharge as a Result of Racial or National Origin Discrimination . . . . .	21-629
D.	Constructive Discharge as a Result of Sex Discrimination . . . . .	21-632
1.	Generally . . . . .	21-632
2.	Constructive Discharge in the Context of Sexual Harassment . . . . .	21-633
E.	Constructive Discharge as a Result of Disability Discrimination . . . . .	21-637
F.	Constructive Discharge in the Context of ERISA . . . . .	21-638
G.	Constructive Discharge in the Context of Religious Discrimination . . . . .	21-638
<b>Chapter 22.</b>	<b>Retaliation . . . . .</b>	<b>22-639</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	22-639
B.	Burden of Proof . . . . .	22-641
1.	Statutory-Based Retaliation Claims . . . . .	22-642
(a)	Plaintiff's <i>Prima Facie</i> Case . . . . .	22-642
(b)	Defendant's Burden of Production . . . . .	22-656
(c)	Evidence of Pretext . . . . .	22-658
(d)	Defendant's Burden in Mixed Motive Cases . . . . .	22-667
2.	First Amendment-Based Retaliation Claims . . . . .	22-668
C.	Protected Conduct or Expression . . . . .	22-688
D.	Adverse Employment Action . . . . .	22-699
E.	Causal Link . . . . .	22-714
1.	General Cases . . . . .	22-714
2.	The Burden of Persuasion . . . . .	22-729
F.	Former Employees . . . . .	22-731
G.	Charge-Filing Requirements . . . . .	22-733
H.	Jury Instructions . . . . .	22-738
<b>Chapter 23.</b>	<b>Affirmative Action . . . . .</b>	<b>23-741</b>
A.	Frequency of Claims Against Affirmative Action Programs . . . . .	23-742
B.	Legal Background . . . . .	23-742
C.	Definition of the Type of Affirmative Action That Triggers Scrutiny . . . . .	23-743
D.	Constitutional Standard for Race-Conscious Plans of Public Agencies . . . . .	23-744
E.	Constitutional Standard for Sex-Conscious Plans of Public Agencies . . . . .	23-748
F.	Title VII Standard of Review for Group-Conscious Selections . . . . .	23-749
G.	Effect of the 1991 Civil Rights Act on Group-Conscious Decisions and Challenges . . . . .	23-749

H.	What Is a Group-Conscious Selection? .....	23-749
I.	Permissible Bases for Group-Conscious Selections .....	23-750
J.	Quantum of Evidence Necessary to Support Group-Conscious Decisions .....	23-762
K.	The “Narrowly Tailored” and “Undue Trammeling” Tests .....	23-764
	1. Necessity .....	23-764
	2. Nonracial Alternatives .....	23-765
	3. Overbreadth in the Groups Benefited .....	23-766
	4. Flexibility and Waivers .....	23-766
	5. Duration of the Goals .....	23-768
	6. Degree of the Goals .....	23-769
	7. Effect of the Relief on Others .....	23-769
	8. Unwritten Plans .....	23-770
L.	The “Substantial Relation” Test in Sex-Conscious Decrees .....	23-770
M.	Termination of Group-Conscious Selections .....	23-770
N.	Challenges to Group-Conscious Plans: Standing, Mootness, Jurisdiction, and Procedure .....	23-771
O.	Challenges to Particular Group-Conscious Selections .....	23-774
P.	Claims of Liability for Failure to Adopt, or Follow, an Affirmative-Action Plan .....	23-775
Q.	The EEOC’s Conferral of Immunity Under § 713(b) of Title VII .....	23-775
R.	Executive Order 11246 .....	23-775
S.	Damages for Emotional Distress Caused by an Unlawful Affirmative Action Plan .....	23-775
<b>Chapter 24.</b>	<b>Tangible Employment Actions Caused by Rejection of Sexual Advances .....</b>	<b>24-776</b>
A.	What Constitutes a Tangible Employment Action Caused by Rejection of Advances? .....	24-776
B.	Same-Sex Harassment .....	24-779
<b>Chapter 25.</b>	<b>Hostile Environment Harassment .....</b>	<b>25-780</b>
A.	Background .....	25-780
B.	What Constitutes a Hostile Environment .....	25-781
	1. Conduct That Is Sufficiently Severe or Pervasive .....	25-781
	(a) The Nature of the Challenged Conduct .....	25-781
	(1) Sexual Harassment .....	25-781
	(2) Racial and Other Forms of Harassment .....	25-790
	(b) Standard for Assessing the Offensiveness of the Environment .....	25-799
	2. Conduct That Is Unwelcome .....	25-801
	(a) The Plaintiff’s Participation in the Conduct .....	25-801
	(b) Evidence Regarding Victim’s Sexual Past .....	25-802
C.	Prompt Remedial Action .....	25-803
	1. Effect of Policy or Remedial Action on Liability .....	25-803
	2. Insufficient Employer Action Leads to Liability or to Trial .....	25-808
D.	Motivation for Harassment Must Be Based on Protected Characteristic .....	25-811
E.	Who May Be Held Liable for Harassment .....	25-812
	1. Individual Liability .....	25-812
	2. Union Liability .....	25-813
	3. Employer Liability—The Notice Requirement, Knowledge, and Agency Principles .....	25-814
	4. Who Is an Employer .....	25-820
F.	Same-Sex/Same-Gender Harassment .....	25-821

G.	Other Theories of Liability for Hostile Environment Harassment . . . . .	25–824
1.	Continuing Violations . . . . .	25–824
2.	Retaliation . . . . .	25–830
3.	The Jones Act . . . . .	25–834
4.	Federal Employers’ Liability Act . . . . .	25–835
H.	Discovery and Evidentiary Issues . . . . .	25–835
I.	Suits by Employees Disciplined for Harassment . . . . .	25–837
1.	Wrongful Termination . . . . .	25–837
2.	Constitutional Torts . . . . .	25–837
<b>Part III.</b>	<b>Employment Litigation . . . . .</b>	<b>838</b>
<b>Chapter 26.</b>	<b>Administrative Exhaustion . . . . .</b>	<b>26–838</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	26–838
B.	Duty to Exhaust . . . . .	26–839
C.	Agency’s Failure to Receive the Charge or Complaint . . . . .	26–840
D.	The “Single Filing” Rule . . . . .	26–841
E.	What Constitutes a Valid Charge . . . . .	26–841
F.	Relationship Between the Allegations of the Charge and of the Judicial Complaint . . . . .	26–843
G.	Claims of Post-Charge Discrimination or of Retaliation . . . . .	26–847
H.	Defendants Not Named in the Charge . . . . .	26–849
I.	Deferral Agencies . . . . .	26–849
J.	Malfeasance by Enforcement Agencies . . . . .	26–850
K.	Worksharing Agreements . . . . .	26–851
L.	Commissioners’ Charges of Discrimination . . . . .	26–851
M.	Failure to Cooperate With the Investigation . . . . .	26–851
N.	Failure to Accept an Offer of “Full Relief” . . . . .	26–852
O.	Early Issuance of Notices of Right to Sue . . . . .	26–852
P.	Early Suits: Filing Before Receipt of the Notice of Right to Sue . . . . .	26–853
Q.	ERISA Claims . . . . .	26–854
R.	Exhaustion of Facts, and of Bases for Claiming a Continuing Violation . . . . .	26–854
S.	Exhaustion of Class Allegations . . . . .	26–854
T.	Exhaustion of Excuses for Untimeliness . . . . .	26–854
U.	Exhaustion of Defenses to an Administrative EEOC Subpoena . . . . .	26–854
V.	Exhaustion of Remedies Sought . . . . .	26–854
W.	Exhaustion of Tribal Remedies by a Tribal Member . . . . .	26–854
X.	Waiver of a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense . . . . .	26–854
Y.	Effect of Withdrawal of a Charge . . . . .	26–854
Z.	“FIRREA” Exhaustion Requirements as to Pre- and Post- Receivership EEO Suits Against Financial Institutions . . . . .	26–854
AA.	Notices of Right to Sue Issued by EEOC Concerning a State or Local Governmental Respondent . . . . .	26–855
BB.	Rehabilitation Act Charges Against a Federal Agency . . . . .	26–855
CC.	ADEA Claims Against a Federal Agency . . . . .	26–855
1.	Notice to the EEOC, Where No Administrative Complaint Has Been Filed . . . . .	26–855
2.	Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies . . . . .	26–855
DD.	The 180-Day Suit-Filing Option for Claims Against a Federal Agency . . . . .	26–855
<b>Chapter 27.</b>	<b>Timeliness . . . . .</b>	<b>27–857</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	27–858

B.	Determination of the Applicable Period of Limitations	27-858
1.	42 U.S.C. §§ 1981, 1983 and 1985	27-858
	(a) District of Columbia	27-860
	(b) Florida	27-860
	(c) Illinois	27-860
	(d) Iowa	27-860
	(e) Kentucky	27-861
	(f) Missouri	27-861
	(g) Puerto Rico	27-861
	(h) Texas	27-861
2.	ADA Claims	27-861
3.	ADEA Claims Against Federal Agencies	27-862
4.	Constitutional Tort Claims Against Federal Officials ( <i>Bivens</i> Actions)	27-862
5.	ERISA Claims for Interference With Rights Under a Plan	27-862
6.	LMRA: “Hybrid” Causes of Action Under § 301	27-862
7.	LMRA: Non-“Hybrid” Causes of Action Under § 301	27-862
8.	LMRDA Claims Under § 101(a)(1)	27-862
9.	Mixed Cases Under the Civil Service Reform Act	27-863
10.	Rehabilitation Act of 1973	27-863
11.	Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964	27-863
12.	Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Title I of the ADA	27-863
	(a) Effect of the Periods of Limitations in Related Statutes	27-863
	(b) Validity of Federal-Sector Regulations Setting Deadlines	27-864
	(c) Title VII Cases Brought by the United States	27-864
13.	Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972	27-864
14.	Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification Act	27-864
C.	Changes Made by the Age Discrimination Claims Assistance Acts	27-865
D.	Changes Made by the Civil Rights Act of 1991	27-865
1.	Challenges to Discriminatory Seniority Systems and Questions Under <i>Lorance</i>	27-865
2.	The ADEA Suit-Filing Period	27-865
3.	The Federal-Sector Title VII Suit-Filing Period	27-865
E.	Events That Start the Clock Running	27-865
1.	General	27-865
2.	Adoption vs. Application of an Employment Practice	27-867
3.	Subsidiary Events Later Leading to an Adverse Employment Action	27-869
4.	Non-Applicants	27-870
5.	Promotional Registers	27-870
6.	Termination of the Plaintiff’s Relationship With the Defendant	27-870
7.	“Hybrid” Cases	27-870
8.	Constructive Receipt of Notices of Right to Sue	27-871
9.	Constructive Receipt of EEOC Decisions	27-872
10.	EEOC’s Decision Not to Use Certified Mail for Notices of Right to Sue	27-872
11.	Pleading Oneself Out of Court	27-872
12.	Appeal Deadlines	27-873
F.	Whether New Actions Are New Decisions or Reassertions of Old Decisions	27-874
G.	Continuing Violations	27-875
1.	General Discussion	27-875
2.	Ability to Obtain Relief for Events Outside the Limitations Period	27-878

3.	Ability to Rely on Evidence of Events Outside the Limitations Period . . . . .	27-884
H.	Discovery Rule . . . . .	27-885
I.	Equitable Estoppel . . . . .	27-887
J.	Equitable Tolling . . . . .	27-889
K.	The Effect of Mental Illness or Distress on Periods of Limitations . . . . .	27-895
L.	Posting of Notices on Charge-Filing Periods . . . . .	27-895
M.	Relation Back of a Perfected Administrative Charge . . . . .	27-895
N.	Relation Back of an Amended Administrative Charge Raising a New Claim . . . . .	27-896
O.	Requests That the EEOC Reconsider a Determination . . . . .	27-896
P.	Relation Back of a Newly Pleaded Claim . . . . .	27-896
Q.	Single-Filing or “Piggybacking” . . . . .	27-897
R.	Tolling Effect of Putative or Certified Class Actions . . . . .	27-897
S.	When Is a Judicial Complaint “Filed”? . . . . .	27-897
T.	Other Events Claimed to Stop the Clock From Running . . . . .	27-898
U.	EEOC Worksharing Agreements With State and Local Agencies . . . . .	27-898
V.	Defendant’s Obligation to Disclose Evidence Relevant to Timeliness. . . . .	27-898
W.	Waiver of a Limitations Defense . . . . .	27-898
X.	Laches . . . . .	27-899
Y.	Judicial Deadlines . . . . .	27-900
Z.	Successors in Interest . . . . .	27-901
AA.	Supplemental Jurisdiction . . . . .	27-901
BB.	Procedural Questions . . . . .	27-901
<b>Chapter 28.</b>	<b>Pre-Dispute Arbitration Agreements . . . . .</b>	<b>28-903</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	28-903
B.	Application of the FAA in Employment Relationships . . . . .	28-906
C.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement on Individual Claim . . . . .	28-906
D.	Ambiguity of Arbitration Agreement and Questions of Controlling Authority . . . . .	28-908
E.	Arbitration Agreements Deemed Valid. . . . .	28-909
F.	Arbitration Agreements Deemed Invalid . . . . .	28-911
G.	Review of Arbitral Orders . . . . .	28-915
H.	Failure to Comply With Arbitration Procedures. . . . .	28-916
I.	Arbitration Agreements and the EEOC . . . . .	28-916
<b>Chapter 29.</b>	<b>Bars to Suit . . . . .</b>	<b>29-919</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	29-919
B.	Abstention and Equitable Restraint . . . . .	29-919
C.	Judicial Estoppel . . . . .	29-921
D.	Collateral Estoppel and Issue Preclusion . . . . .	29-926
E.	<i>Res Judicata</i> , Claim Preclusion, and “Full Faith and Credit” . . . . .	29-930
F.	Defense Preclusion . . . . .	29-936
G.	Effect of Bankruptcy . . . . .	29-936
H.	Election of Remedies . . . . .	29-937
I.	Equitable Estoppel . . . . .	29-937
J.	Mootness . . . . .	29-937
K.	Preemption . . . . .	29-939
L.	Primary Jurisdiction . . . . .	29-943
M.	Releases, Waivers, and Prior Settlements . . . . .	29-945
N.	Rejection of an Offer of Full Relief . . . . .	29-949

O.	Ripeness .....	29-949
P.	<i>Rooker-Feldman</i> Dismissals .....	29-949
Q.	Standing .....	29-950
R.	Bankruptcy .....	29-954
S.	Jurisdiction .....	29-955
T.	Jurisdiction to Enforce Purported Settlement Agreements .....	29-955
U.	Jurisdiction of State-Law Claims for Relief From Arbitration Awards Under the FAA .....	29-955
V.	Other Asserted Bars to Actions or Defenses .....	29-955
W.	Asserted Bars to Appeal .....	29-956
<b>Chapter 30.</b>	<b>Supplemental Jurisdiction .....</b>	<b>30-969</b>
A.	Background .....	30-969
B.	D.C. Circuit .....	30-972
C.	First Circuit .....	30-972
D.	Second Circuit .....	30-972
E.	Third Circuit .....	30-972
F.	Fourth Circuit .....	30-973
G.	Fifth Circuit .....	30-973
H.	Sixth Circuit .....	30-973
I.	Seventh Circuit .....	30-973
J.	Eighth Circuit .....	30-973
K.	Ninth Circuit .....	30-973
L.	Tenth Circuit .....	30-975
M.	Eleventh Circuit .....	30-975
<b>Chapter 31.</b>	<b>Multiple Representation and Disqualification .....</b>	<b>31-976</b>
A.	Duty to Represent a Public Official in Both Official and Personal Capacities, When the Official Is Sued in Both Capacities .....	31-976
B.	Disqualification of Attorney .....	31-976
<b>Chapter 32.</b>	<b>Discovery .....</b>	<b>32-977</b>
A.	Background .....	32-977
B.	Discoverable Matters .....	32-977
C.	Mandatory Initial Disclosures .....	32-978
D.	Interrogatories .....	32-979
E.	Requests for Production .....	32-979
F.	Depositions .....	32-980
G.	Requests for Admissions .....	32-981
H.	Independent Physical or Mental Examinations .....	32-981
I.	Judges' Questions .....	32-981
J.	Deadlines, Extensions, and Stays of Discovery .....	32-981
K.	Protective Orders .....	32-981
L.	Scope of Discovery .....	32-982
M.	Service of Subpoenas .....	32-982
N.	General Adequacy of Discovery .....	32-982
O.	Objections .....	32-982
P.	Motions to Compel Discovery .....	32-982
Q.	Waiver of Discovery .....	32-982
R.	Efforts to Add to Pleadings Through Discovery Responses .....	32-983
S.	Duty to Supplement Responses .....	32-983

<b>Chapter 33.</b>	<b>Class and Representative Actions</b> . . . . .	33–984
A.	Introduction. . . . .	33–985
B.	Necessity of Following Class Procedures Before Granting Class Relief . . . . .	33–986
C.	Discovery Before the Class Determination . . . . .	33–986
D.	Rule 23 Class Actions. . . . .	33–987
	1. Suitability of the Issues for Class Treatment . . . . .	33–987
	2. Suitability of the Class Representative . . . . .	33–988
	3. Discretion to Consider Factors Not Specified in Rule 23 . . . . .	33–989
	4. Numerosity Under Rule 23(a)(1) . . . . .	33–989
	5. Commonality Under Rule 23(a)(2). . . . .	33–989
	6. Typicality Under Rule 23(a)(3). . . . .	33–991
	7. Adequacy of Representation Under Rule 23(a)(4) . . . . .	33–993
	8. Acting and Refusing to Act on Common Grounds Under Rule 23(b)(2). . . . .	33–995
	9. Predominance of Class Questions and Superiority of Class Treatment Under Rule 23(b)(3) . . . . .	33–996
	10. “Hybrid” Class Actions Under Rules 23(b)(2) and (b)(3) . . . . .	33–1001
	11. Adequacy of Notice Under Rule 23(e) . . . . .	33–1002
	12. Final Approval of Settlements . . . . .	33–1002
E.	Settlement Classes . . . . .	33–1002
F.	Changes in Class Certification and Definition . . . . .	33–1003
G.	Individualized Relief for Class Members . . . . .	33–1004
H.	Class Actions Seeking Common-Law Damages . . . . .	33–1004
I.	Opt-Outs From Rule 23 Class Actions . . . . .	33–1011
J.	Enforcement of Class Settlements . . . . .	33–1011
K.	Representative Actions . . . . .	33–1011
L.	Communications With Class Members. . . . .	33–1012
M.	The Tolling Effect of Class Action Filings. . . . .	33–1012
N.	Rule 23(f) Appeals of Decisions Granting or Denying Class Certification . . . . .	33–1012
O.	Appealability of Class Determination. . . . .	33–1013
P.	Judicial Approval of Class Settlements . . . . .	33–1013
Q.	<i>Cy Pres</i> Distributions of Residues of Class Settlement Funds . . . . .	33–1015
R.	Conclusiveness of Class Settlements, Decrees, and Decisions on the Merits . . . . .	33–1015
S.	Class Actions and Arbitrations . . . . .	33–1018
T.	The “Class Action Fairness Act” . . . . .	33–1018
	1. Findings and Purposes . . . . .	33–1019
	2. Effective Date . . . . .	33–1020
	3. “Consumer Class Action Bill of Rights”: New 28 U.S.C. §§ 1712–1714 . . . . .	33–1021
	4. New 28 U.S.C. § 1715 . . . . .	33–1022
	5. Sec. 4 of the Act, and Definitions. . . . .	33–1025
	6. General Expansion of Federal-Court Jurisdiction . . . . .	33–1025
	7. The “One-Third, Two-Thirds” Ballet . . . . .	33–1026
	8. Exceptions and Details . . . . .	33–1028
	9. Mass Actions. . . . .	33–1029
	10. Removal of Class Actions. . . . .	33–1030
	11. Report on Class Action Settlements, and Fee Provision . . . . .	33–1031
	12. The December 1, 2003, Amendments to Rule 23. . . . .	33–1032
	13. Preservation of Rulemaking Authority . . . . .	33–1032
	14. Provisions Dropped from Earlier Versions . . . . .	33–1032

15. Constitutional Questions . . . . .	33–1033
<b>Chapter 34. Summary Judgment . . . . .</b>	<b>34–1034</b>
A. Background . . . . .	34–1035
B. Constitutionality . . . . .	34–1041
C. General Principles . . . . .	34–1042
1. Broad Declarations of Principle . . . . .	34–1042
2. The Movant’s Obligation to Support the Motion Adequately . . . . .	34–1043
3. The Non-Movant’s Obligation to Demonstrate a Genuine Issue of Material Fact . . . . .	34–1043
4. Replies in Support of Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1046
5. Motions and Oppositions Must Be Based on Materials in the Record . . . . .	34–1046
6. No Credibility Assessments or Weighing of Evidence . . . . .	34–1047
7. Inferences . . . . .	34–1049
8. Unsupported Assertions That the Defendant Is Lying . . . . .	34–1050
9. Adequately Supported Assertions That the Defendant Is Lying . . . . .	34–1051
10. Conflicting Statements by the Decisionmaker or Defendant . . . . .	34–1051
11. Submission of Statements Not Supported by Personal Knowledge . . . . .	34–1051
12. Conclusory Statements and Non-Specific Responses . . . . .	34–1052
13. Inadmissible Materials . . . . .	34–1053
14. Statements Altering or Explaining Prior Sworn Testimony . . . . .	34–1054
15. Adequacy of Notice, and <i>Sua Sponte</i> Grants of Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1056
16. Effect of Failure to File an Opposition . . . . .	34–1058
17. Summary Judgment Against <i>Pro Se</i> Litigants . . . . .	34–1058
18. Summary Judgment as to the Qualified Immunity of Public Officials . . . . .	34–1058
19. Summary Judgment as to Affirmative Defenses . . . . .	34–1059
D. Application of the Principles . . . . .	34–1059
1. Materiality . . . . .	34–1059
2. Questions of Intent, and Employment Cases in General . . . . .	34–1059
3. Summary Judgment as to the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case . . . . .	34–1060
4. Summary Judgment as to Pretext . . . . .	34–1061
(a) General Standards . . . . .	34–1061
(b) Evidence Rebutting Some, But Not All, of the Reasons . . . . .	34–1061
5. Evaluations of Sexual Harassment Claims . . . . .	34–1061
E. The Non-Movant’s Right to Discovery . . . . .	34–1061
F. Actions Waiving the Non-Movant’s Right to Discovery . . . . .	34–1062
G. Holding an Evidentiary Hearing on the Motion for Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1064
H. Failure to Follow the Local Rules, and Other Procedural Questions . . . . .	34–1064
I. Effect of the Denial of Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1067
J. Cross-Motions for Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1067
K. General Principles on Review . . . . .	34–1068
1. The General Standard for Review of the Grant of Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1068
2. Limitation of Review to Materials of Record on the Motion . . . . .	34–1068
3. General Limitation of Review to Arguments Made Below . . . . .	34–1068
L. Review of the Denial of Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1069
M. Appealability of the Grant of Partial Summary Judgment . . . . .	34–1070
<b>Chapter 35. Preliminary Injunctions . . . . .</b>	<b>35–1071</b>
A. General Standards . . . . .	35–1071

1.	Introduction	35–1071
2.	Standards for the Grant or Denial of Preliminary Injunction	35–1071
	(a) Likelihood of Success on the Merits	35–1071
	(b) Irreparable Harm	35–1072
	(c) Notice	35–1072
3.	Abstention on a State Law Question	35–1072
4.	Appellate Standards of Review for the Grant or Denial of Preliminary Injunctions	35–1073
B.	Injunctions to Preserve the Status Quo Before a Decision on the Merits	35–1073
	1. Arbitration	35–1073
	2. Irreparable Harm	35–1073
C.	Appeal of the Grant of Preliminary Injunction Allowing Appeal of Nonappealable Orders or Judgments	35–1074
	1. Grant of Preliminary Injunction “Inextricably Intertwined” With Nonappealable Class Certification Order	35–1074
	2. Grant of Preliminary Injunction “Inextricably Intertwined” With Grant of Partial Summary Judgment	35–1074
	3. Preliminary Injunctions That Are Nonappealable Under § 1292(a)(1)	35–1074
D.	Converting Preliminary Injunction to Permanent Injunction	35–1074
E.	Preclusive Effect of Preliminary Injunction Proceedings	35–1074
<b>Chapter 36.</b>	<b>Pretrial Orders and Other Interlocutory Rulings</b>	<b>36–1075</b>
A.	Background	36–1076
B.	Appeal	36–1076
C.	Appeals From Collateral Orders	36–1078
D.	Appointment of Counsel	36–1080
E.	Amendment and Supplementation of Pleadings	36–1080
F.	Association of New Counsel	36–1084
G.	Bifurcation	36–1085
H.	Communications by Counsel	36–1085
I.	Concurrent Jurisdiction	36–1085
J.	Consolidation	36–1085
K.	Continuances and Extensions	36–1085
L.	Default Judgment	36–1086
M.	Defendant’s Attempt to Recast the Case	36–1086
N.	Dismissal for Failure to Make Timely Service	36–1086
O.	Dismissal for Failure to Prosecute	36–1087
P.	Dismissal for Lack of Jurisdiction	36–1088
Q.	Dismissal Because of Pleading Problems	36–1089
R.	Dismissal of a Complaint Filed <i>In Forma Pauperis</i>	36–1099
S.	Dismissal Without Analysis	36–1099
T.	Disposition by a Magistrate Judge	36–1099
U.	Extensions of Time	36–1100
V.	Extension of Time to File Rule 59(e) Motion	36–1100
W.	Extension of Time to File Notice of Appeal	36–1100
X.	Final Orders	36–1100
Y.	Guardians <i>ad Litem</i>	36–1101
Z.	<i>In Forma Pauperis</i> Status	36–1101
AA.	Intervention	36–1102

BB.	Joinder	36-1102
CC.	Law of the Case	36-1102
DD.	Mandamus	36-1103
EE.	Mediation Orders	36-1103
FF.	Mistrials	36-1104
GG.	Offers of Judgment	36-1104
HH.	Objections to Recommended Decisions of Magistrate Judges	36-1106
II.	Orders Enforcing Settlements	36-1106
JJ.	Other Types of Orders	36-1106
KK.	Postjudgment Interest	36-1107
LL.	Pretrial Orders	36-1107
MM.	Right to Jury Trial	36-1108
NN.	Reconsideration Under Rule 59(e)	36-1108
OO.	Recusal and Reassignment	36-1109
PP.	Removal and Remand	36-1111
QQ.	Rule 54(b) Partial Final Judgments	36-1115
RR.	Sealing Parts of the Record	36-1116
SS.	Scheduling Orders	36-1116
TT.	Separate Documents Setting Forth Judgments	36-1116
UU.	Stays of Judgment	36-1116
VV.	Transfer of Venue, or Dismissal for <i>Forum Non Conveniens</i>	36-1117
WW.	Entry of Judgments Differing From the Jury Verdict	36-1117
XX.	Rule 60(b) Motions for Relief From the Judgment	36-1117
YY.	Waiver Because of Failure to Raise an Issue Earlier	36-1119
ZZ.	Withdrawal of Counsel	36-1120
<b>Chapter 37.</b>	<b>Motions in Limine</b>	37-1121
A.	General Principles	37-1121
B.	Relevant Rules of Evidence	37-1121
C.	Preservation of Objections	37-1122
D.	Particular Types of Evidence Addressed in Motions in Limine	37-1122
	1. "Me Too"	37-1122
	2. Incidents Remote in Time	37-1123
	3. Motive	37-1123
	4. EEOC Determinations	37-1123
	5. Inferences and Character Evidence	37-1123
	6. Sources of Emotional Distress	37-1123
	7. Affirmative Action Plans	37-1123
	8. Termination Agreements	37-1123
	9. Damages	37-1123
	10. Miscellaneous	37-1123
<b>Chapter 38.</b>	<b>Limits on Peremptory Challenges to Prospective Jurors</b>	38-1124
A.	Background	38-1124
B.	Employment Cases	38-1127
C.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case	38-1128
D.	Race-Neutral Explanation	38-1130
E.	Court's Determination	38-1137

1.	<i>Batson</i> Findings Affirmed	38–1137
2.	<i>Batson</i> Findings Reversed	38–1145
<b>Chapter 39.</b>	<b>Evidence</b>	39–1149
A.	Introduction	39–1150
B.	Admissions	39–1150
C.	Alternative Inconsistent Defenses	39–1154
D.	Arbitral Awards	39–1154
E.	Background Evidence	39–1154
F.	Best Evidence Rule	39–1154
G.	Business Records and Employee Journals	39–1155
H.	Character	39–1155
I.	Clear Error	39–1156
J.	Common Knowledge	39–1156
K.	Competence	39–1156
L.	Criminal Convictions	39–1157
M.	Cumulative Evidence	39–1158
N.	Determinations of the EEOC and State and Local Agencies	39–1159
O.	Foundation	39–1161
P.	Harmless Error	39–1162
Q.	Hearsay and Its Exceptions	39–1163
R.	Hypothetical Questions	39–1168
S.	Judicial Comments on Evidence During a Jury Trial	39–1168
T.	<i>In Camera</i> Evidence	39–1168
U.	Invited Error Doctrine	39–1168
V.	Judicial Notice	39–1168
W.	Lay Opinions	39–1169
X.	Legal Opinions	39–1171
Y.	“Missing Witness” or Document Inferences	39–1172
Z.	Opening the Door	39–1172
AA.	Other Occurrences of Similar Conduct	39–1173
BB.	Perjury	39–1176
CC.	Plaintiff’s Own Testimony	39–1176
DD.	Prejudice and Confusion	39–1177
EE.	Preservation—or Waiver—of Evidentiary Points	39–1181
FF.	Prior Bad Acts	39–1182
GG.	Privilege	39–1182
HH.	Probative Value	39–1185
II.	Purpose for Which the Evidence Is Offered	39–1185
JJ.	Relevance	39–1185
KK.	Representations to the EEOC and State and Local Agencies	39–1189
LL.	Reputation	39–1190
MM.	Scope of Cross-Examination	39–1190
NN.	Self-Evaluative Privilege	39–1190
OO.	Self-Incrimination	39–1190
PP.	Settlement Communications	39–1190
QQ.	Sexual Behavior	39–1190
RR.	Spoliation of Evidence	39–1191
SS.	Stealing	39–1191

TT.	Stipulations .....	39-1192
UU.	Subsequent Acts .....	39-1192
VV.	Summaries of Documents .....	39-1193
WW.	Taking the Fifth Amendment .....	39-1193
XX.	Tape Recordings .....	39-1193
YY.	Undisclosed Witnesses .....	39-1194
ZZ.	Other Questions .....	39-1194
<b>Chapter 40.</b>	<b>Experts .....</b>	<b>40-1196</b>
A.	Introduction .....	40-1196
B.	<i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i> .....	40-1197
	1. Scientific Evidence .....	40-1198
	2. Nonscientific Evidence .....	40-1198
C.	Particular Types of Expert Testimony .....	40-1199
	1. Opinions on Liability Issues .....	40-1199
	(a) Ultimate Issue .....	40-1199
	(b) Statistics .....	40-1199
	2. Damages Testimony .....	40-1200
	(a) Mental Examinations / Damages .....	40-1200
	(b) Economists .....	40-1200
	(c) Vocational Issues .....	40-1201
D.	Other Admissibility Issues .....	40-1201
	1. Qualifications .....	40-1201
	2. Sufficiency of the Evidence .....	40-1201
	3. Exclusion Due to Late or Inadequate Disclosure Prior to Trial .....	40-1201
<b>Chapter 41.</b>	<b>Trial Management Issues .....</b>	<b>41-1203</b>
A.	Background .....	41-1203
B.	Consolidation of Cases .....	41-1203
C.	Severance or Joinder of Cases or Claims .....	41-1204
D.	Continuance .....	41-1204
E.	Bifurcation of the Trial .....	41-1204
F.	Referral to the Magistrate Judge .....	41-1204
G.	Jury Trial .....	41-1205
H.	Trial Subpoenas .....	41-1206
I.	Opening Arguments .....	41-1206
J.	Questioning of Witnesses by the Court .....	41-1206
K.	Sequestration of Witnesses .....	41-1207
L.	Opening the Door to Otherwise Inadmissible Evidence .....	41-1207
M.	Rebuttal .....	41-1207
N.	Reopening the Record .....	41-1207
O.	Closing Arguments .....	41-1208
P.	Other Trial Management Techniques .....	41-1209
Q.	Findings of Fact .....	41-1210
R.	Appointment of Technical Experts to Advise the Court <i>In Camera</i> .....	41-1211
S.	Juror Bias .....	41-1211
T.	Use of Masters .....	41-1211
U.	Notes from Jurors .....	41-1212
V.	Law of the Case Doctrine .....	41-1212

<b>Chapter 42.</b>	<b>Jury Verdicts / Instructions</b> .....	42–1213
A.	Background .....	42–1213
B.	Simplifying Jury Instructions .....	42–1213
C.	Constructive Discharge .....	42–1215
D.	Age Discrimination Cases .....	42–1215
E.	Sex Discrimination Cases .....	42–1216
F.	Sexual Harassment Cases .....	42–1218
G.	Race Discrimination Cases .....	42–1222
H.	National Origin Discrimination Cases .....	42–1224
I.	Disability Cases .....	42–1224
J.	Religious Discrimination Cases .....	42–1226
K.	Retaliation Cases .....	42–1227
L.	FLSA Cases .....	42–1229
M.	FMLA Cases .....	42–1229
N.	Constitutional and Civil Rights Cases .....	42–1231
O.	Damages .....	42–1232
	1. Punitive Damages .....	42–1232
	2. Other Damages Issues .....	42–1232
P.	Jury Verdict Form .....	42–1234
<b>Chapter 43.</b>	<b>Taking the Case From the Jury</b> .....	43–1236
A.	Background .....	43–1236
B.	Application by the Supreme Court .....	43–1237
C.	Application by the Courts of Appeals .....	43–1239
	1. D.C. Circuit .....	43–1239
	2. First Circuit .....	43–1239
	3. Second Circuit .....	43–1241
	4. Third Circuit .....	43–1242
	5. Fourth Circuit .....	43–1243
	6. Fifth Circuit .....	43–1243
	7. Sixth Circuit .....	43–1245
	8. Seventh Circuit .....	43–1245
	9. Eighth Circuit .....	43–1247
	10. Ninth Circuit .....	43–1248
	11. Tenth Circuit .....	43–1249
	12. Eleventh Circuit .....	43–1250
<b>Part IV.</b>	<b>Remedies</b> .....	1252
<b>Chapter 44.</b>	<b>Injunctive Relief</b> .....	44–1252
A.	Background .....	44–1252
B.	Allocation of the Burden of Proof on the Subject of Injury to the Plaintiff .....	44–1252
C.	Definition of an Injunction .....	44–1252
D.	Preliminary Injunctions .....	44–1252
E.	Entitlement to Injunctive Relief .....	44–1254
F.	Right to Object to Injunctive Relief .....	44–1256
G.	Scope of Injunctive Relief .....	44–1256
H.	Injunctions Against Legislative Bodies .....	44–1256
I.	Bumping an Unlawfully Selected Incumbent .....	44–1256
J.	Defenses to Injunctive Relief .....	44–1256

K.	Special Masters Overseeing Injunctive Relief . . . . .	44-1257
L.	Enforcement of Injunctive Relief . . . . .	44-1257
M.	Judicial Approval of Consent Decrees . . . . .	44-1258
N.	Construction of Consent Decrees . . . . .	44-1258
O.	Modification of Decrees . . . . .	44-1258
P.	Termination of Injunctive Relief . . . . .	44-1262
Q.	Suits for Injunctions to Enforce Settlement Agreements . . . . .	44-1262
R.	Notice Requirements . . . . .	44-1263
S.	Contempt . . . . .	44-1263
T.	Injunctions Against State-Court Proceedings . . . . .	44-1263
U.	Appeals From Injunctions . . . . .	44-1263
<b>Chapter 45.</b>	<b>Back Pay . . . . .</b>	<b>45-1264</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	45-1264
B.	Entitlement to Back Pay . . . . .	45-1265
C.	Start of the Back Pay Period . . . . .	45-1266
D.	End of the Back Pay Period . . . . .	45-1266
E.	Elements of Back Pay . . . . .	45-1267
F.	Interim Earnings . . . . .	45-1267
G.	Mitigation . . . . .	45-1267
H.	Method of Calculation . . . . .	45-1269
I.	Offers of Reinstatement . . . . .	45-1270
J.	Collateral Source Benefits . . . . .	45-1270
K.	Overlapping Awards . . . . .	45-1270
L.	Additur . . . . .	45-1270
M.	Collection of the Award . . . . .	45-1271
N.	Taxes . . . . .	45-1271
O.	Adequacy of a Classwide Settlement . . . . .	45-1271
P.	Procedural Questions . . . . .	45-1271
<b>Chapter 46.</b>	<b>Reinstatement and Front Pay . . . . .</b>	<b>46-1272</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	46-1272
B.	Eligibility for Reinstatement . . . . .	46-1273
C.	Reinstatement vs. Front Pay . . . . .	46-1273
D.	Awards of Front Pay Where Liquidated Damages Are Awarded . . . . .	46-1274
E.	Other Decisions Whether to Award Front Pay . . . . .	46-1274
F.	Determination of the Amount of Front Pay . . . . .	46-1277
G.	Collateral Benefits . . . . .	46-1278
H.	Reduction of Front Pay Award to Present Value . . . . .	46-1279
I.	Relationship Between Front Pay and Lost Future Earnings . . . . .	46-1279
J.	Procedural Questions . . . . .	46-1279
<b>Chapter 47.</b>	<b>Prejudgment Interest . . . . .</b>	<b>47-1280</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	47-1280
B.	Decisions Whether to Award Prejudgment Interest . . . . .	47-1280
	1. ADEA, Equal Pay Act, and FLSA Cases . . . . .	47-1280
	2. ERISA Cases . . . . .	47-1281
	3. All Other Cases . . . . .	47-1281
C.	Decisions on the Amount of Prejudgment Interest . . . . .	47-1281
D.	Postjudgment Interest . . . . .	47-1281

<b>Chapter 48.</b>	<b>Compensatory Damages</b> .....	48-1282
A.	Background .....	48-1282
B.	Availability .....	48-1282
	1. Title VII and the ADA .....	48-1283
	2. Title IX and Section 504 .....	48-1283
	3. FMLA .....	48-1284
	4. ADEA .....	48-1284
	5. Fair Labor Standards Act .....	48-1284
	6. Governmental Bodies .....	48-1285
C.	Standard .....	48-1285
D.	Cases .....	48-1285
	1. Proof and Causation .....	48-1285
	2. Damage Caps .....	48-1288
	3. Availability of Compensatory Damages .....	48-1289
	4. Trial Issues .....	48-1290
	5. Appropriateness of Award Amount .....	48-1290
	6. Government Recovery of Medicaid Costs .....	48-1295
<b>Chapter 49.</b>	<b>Punitive Damages</b> .....	49-1296
A.	Background .....	49-1296
B.	Availability .....	49-1297
C.	Standard .....	49-1299
D.	Vicarious Liability for Punitive Damages .....	49-1301
	1. The Requisite “State of Mind” That Supports Punitive Damages .....	49-1305
	2. Who Is an Employer’s “Agent” for Imputing Vicarious Liability .....	49-1308
	3. What Constitutes “Good Faith Effort” for Defeating Punitive Damages .....	49-1309
E.	Conduct That Does and Does Not Warrant Punitive Damages .....	49-1311
F.	Standards for Assessing the Amount .....	49-1313
	1. Proportionality / Relationship of Punitive and Compensatory Damages .....	49-1314
	2. Excessiveness in Light of Conduct .....	49-1316
	3. Individual Liability .....	49-1318
	4. Measure .....	49-1319
G.	Damage Caps .....	49-1319
<b>Chapter 50.</b>	<b>Liquidated Damages</b> .....	50-1322
A.	Background .....	50-1322
B.	Age Discrimination in Employment Act (“ADEA”) .....	50-1323
	1. Availability .....	50-1323
	2. Cases .....	50-1324
C.	Fair Labor Standards Act (“FLSA”) .....	50-1326
	1. Availability .....	50-1326
	2. Cases .....	50-1326
D.	Equal Pay Act (“EPA”) .....	50-1327
	1. Availability .....	50-1327
	2. Cases .....	50-1327
E.	Family and Medical Leave Act (“FMLA”) .....	50-1327
	1. Availability .....	50-1327
	2. Cases .....	50-1327

<b>Chapter 51.</b>	<b>Special Damages Questions Under 42 U.S.C. § 1981a</b> . . . . .	51-1329
A.	Background . . . . .	51-1329
B.	Effects of the Effective Date . . . . .	51-1329
C.	The Prohibition on Mentioning the Caps to the Jury . . . . .	51-1329
D.	Determining the Number of Employees for Purposes of the Damages Caps . . . . .	51-1329
E.	Inability to Recover Under 42 U.S.C. § 1981 . . . . .	51-1329
F.	Effect of State Law Under 42 U.S.C. § 1988(a) . . . . .	51-1330
G.	Coverage and Application of the Caps . . . . .	51-1330
	1. Constitutionality . . . . .	51-1330
	2. Coverage . . . . .	51-1330
	3. Front Pay . . . . .	51-1331
	4. Caps Per Claim, or Caps Per Capita? . . . . .	51-1331
	5. Caps in an Action Brought by the Government . . . . .	51-1331
	6. Allocation of Damages . . . . .	51-1331
	7. Complaining Parties . . . . .	51-1332
H.	Relationship Between Compensatory and Punitive Damages . . . . .	51-1332
I.	Reductions of Awards Below the Caps . . . . .	51-1332
J.	Punitive Damages . . . . .	51-1333
<b>Chapter 52.</b>	<b>“After-Acquired” Defenses to Relief Under <i>McKennon</i></b> . . . . .	52-1334
A.	Background . . . . .	52-1334
B.	The Decision . . . . .	52-1334
C.	Broad Application of <i>McKennon</i> . . . . .	52-1335
	1. Application to Different Causes of Action . . . . .	52-1335
	2. Misconduct During the Hiring Process . . . . .	52-1335
	3. Misconduct After Termination . . . . .	52-1336
	4. General Application . . . . .	52-1336
D.	Inapplicability of <i>McKennon</i> to Predictions of Future Wrongdoing . . . . .	52-1337
E.	Waiver of the Defense . . . . .	52-1337
F.	Establishing That the Wrongdoing Would, if Known, Have Led to Discharge or Other Adverse Consequences . . . . .	52-1337
	1. The Meaning of “Establish” . . . . .	52-1337
	2. Severity of the Alleged Misconduct . . . . .	52-1337
	3. Elements of the Defendant’s Showing . . . . .	52-1337
	(a) Qualitative Requirements . . . . .	52-1337
	(b) Possible vs. Certain Consequences . . . . .	52-1338
	(c) Application of the Standards . . . . .	52-1338
G.	Contentions of Excessive Employer Inquiries . . . . .	52-1338
H.	Contentions of Extraordinary Equitable Circumstances Mitigating the Rule . . . . .	52-1339
I.	Effect of the Rule on Liquidated Damages . . . . .	52-1339
J.	Effect of the Rule on Compensatory and Punitive Damages . . . . .	52-1339
K.	Plaintiffs’ Efforts to Use the Doctrine to Bar Evidence . . . . .	52-1339
<b>Chapter 53.</b>	<b>Workers’ Compensation</b> . . . . .	53-1340
A.	Background . . . . .	53-1340
B.	Coverage of Workers’ Compensation Acts . . . . .	53-1340
	1. Arising Out of Employment . . . . .	53-1340
	2. Exceptions to Workers’ Compensation Exclusivity . . . . .	53-1340
	(a) Intentional Tort Exception . . . . .	53-1340

	(b) Negligence Claims .....	53–1341
	(c) Nature of the Injury .....	53–1341
C.	Preemption of Antidiscrimination Statutes .....	53–1341
D.	Issue Preclusion / Collateral Estoppel / Judicial Estoppel .....	53–1341
E.	Damages .....	53–1341
F.	Scope of Release .....	53–1341
G.	Removal .....	53–1341
H.	Jurisdiction .....	53–1341
<b>Chapter 54.</b>	<b>Taxation</b> .....	<b>54–1342</b>
A.	Taxation of Damages Awarded Under Anti-Discrimination Statutes—General Overview of Section 104(a)(2) of the Internal Revenue Code .....	54–1342
B.	Taxation of Damages Awarded Under Anti-Discrimination Statutes—Cases Interpreting Current Section 104(a)(2) and Recent Constitutional Challenges .....	54–1343
C.	Taxation of Damages Awarded Under Anti-Discrimination Statutes—Cases Interpreting Prior Section 104(a)(2) .....	54–1345
D.	Taxation of Damages Awarded Under Anti-Discrimination Statutes—Wage vs. Nonwage Income .....	54–1347
E.	Allocation of Payments to Settle Different Claims .....	54–1348
F.	Tax Characterization of Prejudgment Interest .....	54–1353
G.	Tax Considerations in Connection With Payments for Back Pay .....	54–1354
H.	Deductibility by Employees of Attorney’s Fees Incurred in Employment-Related Cases—Current Law .....	54–1355
I.	Deductibility by Employees of Attorney’s Fees Incurred in Employment-Related Cases—Prior to Enactment of the Jobs Act and Recent Decision by U.S. Supreme Court .....	54–1356
J.	Information Reporting Requirements for Payments to Attorneys .....	54–1358
<b>Chapter 55.</b>	<b>Attorneys’ Fees and Costs</b> .....	<b>55–1362</b>
A.	Background .....	55–1363
B.	Decisions Affirming Fee Awards With Minimal Discussion .....	55–1365
	1. Appeals Taken by Prevailing Plaintiffs .....	55–1366
	2. Appeals Taken by Losing Defendants .....	55–1366
	3. Appeals Taken by Sanctioned Plaintiffs .....	55–1366
C.	Decisions Affirming Fee Awards With Limited Discussion .....	55–1366
	1. Appeals Taken by Prevailing Plaintiffs .....	55–1366
	2. Appeals Taken by Losing Defendants .....	55–1367
D.	Fees Under the “Catalyst” Theory .....	55–1367
E.	Fees Under <i>Farrar v. Hobby</i> .....	55–1369
F.	Other Aspects of “Prevailing Party” Status .....	55–1369
G.	Identifying the Payor When There Is More Than One Defendant .....	55–1370
H.	Entitlement to Fees for a “Common Benefit” .....	55–1370
I.	Entitlement to Fees as an Item of Damages .....	55–1373
J.	Entitlement to Statutory Fees .....	55–1373
	1. Non-ERISA Cases .....	55–1373
	2. ERISA Cases .....	55–1373
	3. Fees for Attorneys Representing Themselves, and in Other <i>Pro Se</i> Cases .....	55–1374
	4. Special Problems in Seeking Fees Against Federal Agencies .....	55–1374

5.	Fees for Obtaining a Remand of an Improperly Removed Case . . . . .	55-1374
6.	Fees for Seeking Contempt Citations . . . . .	55-1375
7.	Fees for Final Distribution of the Settlement Fund . . . . .	55-1375
8.	Fees for Obtaining a TRO . . . . .	55-1375
9.	Fees Under the Equal Access to Justice Act . . . . .	55-1375
10.	Fees for Defending a Consent Decree in a Separate Action . . . . .	55-1377
11.	Fee Awards in FOIA Cases . . . . .	55-1377
12.	Fee Awards to Prevailing Defendants . . . . .	55-1377
K.	Use of an Advisory Commission . . . . .	55-1377
L.	The Lodestar . . . . .	55-1377
1.	Compensable Hours . . . . .	55-1377
(a)	Compensable Time . . . . .	55-1377
(b)	Reasonableness of the Hours Claimed . . . . .	55-1378
(c)	Adequacy of the Recordkeeping . . . . .	55-1379
(d)	Billing Judgment . . . . .	55-1380
(e)	Time Spent on the Fee Application . . . . .	55-1380
(f)	Paralegal and Law Clerk Time . . . . .	55-1380
2.	Hourly Rates . . . . .	55-1380
(a)	The Community Used as a Basis for the Rates . . . . .	55-1380
(b)	Current vs. Historical Rates . . . . .	55-1381
(c)	Different Rates for Different Types of Work . . . . .	55-1382
(d)	The Hourly Rates . . . . .	55-1382
M.	Reductions in the Lodestar for Unsuccessful Issues, or Limited Success . . . . .	55-1383
N.	Reductions in the Lodestar to Achieve Proportionality Between Relief and Fee . . . . .	55-1385
O.	Other Reductions in the Lodestar . . . . .	55-1387
P.	Enhancements to the Lodestar . . . . .	55-1388
1.	Under Federal Law . . . . .	55-1388
2.	Under State Law . . . . .	55-1389
Q.	Fees in Mixed-Motive Cases, Where the Defendant Carries Its Burden . . . . .	55-1389
R.	Fees for Services Performed on the Appeal . . . . .	55-1389
S.	Allocation of Fees Among Prevailing Counsel . . . . .	55-1389
T.	Interim Fees . . . . .	55-1389
U.	Costs and Expenses . . . . .	55-1390
V.	Waiver of Fees, and “Special Circumstances” . . . . .	55-1392
W.	Review of Contingent-Fee Retainer Agreements . . . . .	55-1392
X.	Procedural Questions . . . . .	55-1392
<b>Chapter 56.</b>	<b>Sanctions . . . . .</b>	<b>56-1393</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	56-1394
B.	Interpretations of the Authority to Impose Sanctions, and Standards of Review . . . . .	56-1395
1.	Rule 11, Fed. R. Civ. P. . . . .	56-1395
2.	Rule 16, Fed. R. Civ. P. . . . .	56-1398
3.	Rule 26(g), Fed. R. Civ. P. . . . .	56-1398
4.	Rule 37(b), Fed. R. Civ. P. . . . .	56-1398
5.	Rule 41(b), Fed. R. Civ. P. . . . .	56-1400
6.	Sanctions Under 28 U.S.C. § 1915(e)(2)(A) . . . . .	56-1400
7.	Sanctions Under 28 U.S.C. § 1927 . . . . .	56-1400
8.	Inherent Power of the Court . . . . .	56-1401
9.	Awards of Attorneys’ Fees Under <i>Christiansburg Garment</i> . . . . .	56-1401

10.	Appellate Sanctions Under Rule 38, Fed. R. App. P. . . . .	56-1403
11.	Sanctions for Ethics Violations . . . . .	56-1404
12.	“Vexatious Litigant” Orders . . . . .	56-1405
13.	State Law . . . . .	56-1405
C.	Severity of the Sanction . . . . .	56-1405
D.	The Conduct in Question . . . . .	56-1406
1.	Dissembling on <i>In Forma Pauperis</i> Applications . . . . .	56-1406
2.	Pleadings . . . . .	56-1406
3.	Contacts With Witnesses . . . . .	56-1408
4.	Destruction of Evidence . . . . .	56-1408
5.	Discovery . . . . .	56-1408
6.	Falsification of Documents . . . . .	56-1410
7.	Filing or Maintaining a Baseless Case . . . . .	56-1410
8.	Statements in Open Court . . . . .	56-1411
9.	Removal and Remand . . . . .	56-1411
10.	Refusal to Settle . . . . .	56-1411
11.	Failure to Attend Conferences, or Meet Scheduling Orders . . . . .	56-1411
12.	Unreadiness to Proceed . . . . .	56-1412
13.	Improper Post-Trial Interviews of Jurors . . . . .	56-1412
14.	Filing an Inadequate Supersedeas Bond . . . . .	56-1412
15.	Sanctions for a Frivolous Appeal . . . . .	56-1413
16.	Sanctions for Failure to Follow Appellate Rules . . . . .	56-1413
17.	Sanctions for Procedural Violations by Winning Counsel . . . . .	56-1413
18.	Lack of Civility . . . . .	56-1413
E.	Ethical Considerations . . . . .	56-1414
F.	Procedure . . . . .	56-1414
G.	Reversals of Sanctions for Making a Contention Wrongly Considered Frivolous . . . . .	56-1415
H.	Appeal of the Decision on Sanctions . . . . .	56-1415
<b>Part V.</b>	<b>Special Issues</b> . . . . .	1416
<b>Chapter 57.</b>	<b>Special Issues With Government Contractors</b> . . . . .	57-1416
A.	Background . . . . .	57-1416
B.	Federal Employers’ Liability Act . . . . .	57-1416
C.	Legal Authority for Executive Order 11246 . . . . .	57-1416
D.	Coverage . . . . .	57-1416
E.	Effect of Constitutional and Title VII Standards on the OFCCP’s Enforcement of Executive Order 11246 . . . . .	57-1417
F.	First Amendment Rights of Free Speech and Association . . . . .	57-1417
G.	Debarment . . . . .	57-1417
H.	Review . . . . .	57-1417
<b>Chapter 58.</b>	<b>Special Issues With State and Local Governmental Defendants</b> . . . . .	58-1418
A.	Background . . . . .	58-1419
B.	The First Amendment . . . . .	58-1420
1.	Public Employees’ Right to Freedom of Speech . . . . .	58-1420
2.	Public Employees’ Right to Freedom of Religion . . . . .	58-1437
3.	Public Employees, Political Affiliation, and Patronage . . . . .	58-1438
4.	Public Employees’ Right to Associational Freedom . . . . .	58-1443

	5. Public Employees' Right to Run for Election .....	58-1446
	6. Public Employees' Right to Petition the Government .....	58-1446
	7. Public Employees' Right to Intimate Association .....	58-1446
	8. Vagueness of Restrictions on Public Employees .....	58-1447
C.	The Fourth Amendment .....	58-1447
D.	The Fifth Amendment .....	58-1449
E.	The Eighth Amendment's Prohibition Against Cruel and Unusual Punishment .....	58-1452
F.	The Eleventh Amendment .....	58-1452
	1. <i>Alden v. Maine</i> and State Sovereign Immunity in General .....	58-1452
	2. <i>Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida</i> and Its Progeny .....	58-1453
	(a) Equal Pay Act Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1454
	(b) Age Discrimination Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1454
	(c) ADA and Rehabilitation Act Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1456
	(d) Fair Labor Standards Act Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1459
	(e) Veterans' Reemployment Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1459
	(f) Title VII Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1459
	(g) Title VI Cases Against the State as Educator .....	58-1461
	(h) Title IX Cases Against the State as Educator or Employer .....	58-1461
	(i) Family and Medical Leave Act Cases Against the State as Employer .....	58-1461
	(j) 42 U.S.C. §§ 1981, 1983, and 1985 .....	58-1462
	3. Waiver of Sovereign Immunity .....	58-1462
	4. Other Eleventh Amendment Decisions .....	58-1464
G.	The Fourteenth Amendment .....	58-1468
	1. The Due Process Clause .....	58-1468
	(a) Property Interests in Employment .....	58-1468
	(b) Procedural Due Process .....	58-1475
	(c) Substantive Due Process .....	58-1482
	(d) Liberty Interests .....	58-1486
	2. The Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment .....	58-1493
	(a) Classifications Other Than Sexual Orientation .....	58-1493
	(b) Sexual Orientation .....	58-1495
H.	42 U.S.C. § 1981 Claims Involving State, County, and Municipal Employment .....	58-1495
I.	42 U.S.C. § 1983 Claims Involving State, County, and Municipal Employment .....	58-1495
	1. The Construction of 42 U.S.C. § 1983 .....	58-1495
	2. Relationship to Other Causes of Action .....	58-1498
	3. The "State Action" Requirement .....	58-1498
J.	Monetary Relief Against State and Local Government Agencies	
	Under 42 U.S.C. §§ 1981 and 1983 .....	58-1499
	1. The "Official Policy" Requirement .....	58-1499
	2. Identifying the Policymaker .....	58-1501
	3. Liability of a Municipality Where No Individuals Are Liable .....	58-1504
	4. Immunity of a Municipality for Its Legislative Actions .....	58-1505
K.	Identification of State Officials for Purposes of Immunity From	
	Damages Claims Against Them in Their Official Capacities .....	58-1505
L.	Personal Immunity of State and Local Government Officials From	
	Suits for Monetary Relief Under 42 U.S.C. §§ 1981 and 1983 .....	58-1505
	1. Immunity for Legislative Actions .....	58-1505
	2. Immunity of Judges, Hearing Officers, and Prosecutors .....	58-1507
	3. Qualified Immunity .....	58-1508

(a)	General	58–1509
(b)	Heightened Pleading, and the Burden of Persuasion	58–1512
(c)	Appealability	58–1514
(d)	Disability Cases	58–1518
(e)	Harassment Cases	58–1518
(f)	Political Affiliation Cases	58–1518
(g)	Other First Amendment Cases	58–1519
(h)	Fourth Amendment Cases	58–1523
(i)	Mixed-Motive Cases	58–1523
(j)	Race, Sex, Religion, Age, and National Origin Discrimination Cases	58–1523
(k)	Retaliation Cases	58–1525
(l)	Affirmative Action Cases	58–1526
(m)	Procedural and Substantive Due Process Cases	58–1526
(n)	Other Cases	58–1528
<b>Chapter 59.</b>	<b>Special Issues With Federal Employers</b>	<b>59–1529</b>
A.	Background	59–1529
B.	The First Amendment	59–1530
C.	The Fourth Amendment	59–1531
D.	The Fifth Amendment	59–1531
E.	Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964	59–1532
F.	The Effect of Agency and EEOC Administrative Determinations	59–1533
G.	The EEOC’s Federal-Sector EEO Regulations	59–1534
H.	Exclusiveness of the Title VII and Rehabilitation Act Remedies	59–1535
I.	The Back Pay Act	59–1535
J.	The Civil Service Reform Act of 1978	59–1535
K.	Whether the Civil Service Reform Act Is the Exclusive Remedy	59–1535
L.	Mixed Cases	59–1536
M.	Special Aspects of Age Discrimination Claims Against Federal Agencies	59–1537
N.	The Federal Employees’ Compensation Act	59–1539
O.	The Federal Tort Claims Act	59–1539
P.	The Westfall Act and State-Law Tort Claims Against Federal Officials	59–1539
Q.	The Family and Medical Leave Act	59–1541
R.	The Tucker Act	59–1541
S.	The Administrative Procedure Act	59–1541
T.	Constitutional Torts	59–1541
U.	Whistleblower Protection Act	59–1542
V.	Congressional Accountability Act	59–1543
W.	Other Claims	59–1543
X.	Other Aspects of Sovereign Immunity	59–1544
Y.	Punitive Damages and the Postal Service	59–1544
Z.	Removal for EEO-Related Offenses	59–1544
AA.	Qualified Immunity	59–1544
BB.	Unions	59–1544
<b>Chapter 60.</b>	<b>Special Issues With the EEOC as a Litigant</b>	<b>60–1545</b>
A.	Background	60–1545
B.	The Administrative Process	60–1545
C.	Enforcement Suits by the EEOC	60–1548

---

D.	Effect on Individuals of the EEOC’s Involvement in Their Cases . . . . .	60–1550
E.	Suits to Obtain EEOC Records . . . . .	60–1550
<b>Chapter 61.</b>	<b>Judicial Tips on Effective Advocacy . . . . .</b>	<b>61–1551</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	61–1551
B.	Ambush . . . . .	61–1551
C.	Appellate Persuasion . . . . .	61–1551
D.	Assembling the Record . . . . .	61–1552
E.	Avoiding the Wrong Kind of Client . . . . .	61–1552
F.	Candor . . . . .	61–1552
G.	Contentiousness . . . . .	61–1553
H.	Failure to Explore Settlement . . . . .	61–1554
I.	Failure to Follow the Rules . . . . .	61–1554
J.	Failure to Spot the Relevant Issues . . . . .	61–1555
K.	Meeting Deadlines . . . . .	61–1556
L.	Organization . . . . .	61–1556
M.	Perfunctory Contentions . . . . .	61–1558
N.	Pleadings . . . . .	61–1558
O.	Trial Skills . . . . .	61–1559
P.	Writing Skills . . . . .	61–1559
<b>Chapter 62.</b>	<b>Topical Summary of Supreme Court Activity . . . . .</b>	<b>62–1560</b>
A.	Background . . . . .	62–1560
B.	Arbitration . . . . .	62–1560
C.	Civil Procedure . . . . .	62–1563
D.	Civil Rights . . . . .	62–1583
E.	Constitutional Law . . . . .	62–1602
F.	Employee Benefits . . . . .	62–1603
G.	Employment Discrimination . . . . .	62–1615
H.	Evidence . . . . .	62–1651
I.	Health Care . . . . .	62–1652
J.	Labor . . . . .	62–1662
K.	Local Government . . . . .	62–1677
L.	Occupational Safety . . . . .	62–1697
M.	States . . . . .	62–1698
N.	United States . . . . .	62–1702
O.	Workers’ Compensation . . . . .	62–1713
	<b>Treatise Bibliography . . . . .</b>	<b>B–1717</b>
	<b>Table of Cases . . . . .</b>	<b>T–1721</b>